

**SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE, STATE OF CALIFORNIA**



ITEM: 2.4
(ID # 14772)

MEETING DATE:
Tuesday, March 23, 2021

FROM : AUDITOR CONTROLLER:

SUBJECT: AUDITOR-CONTROLLER: Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment, Follow-up Audit, All Districts. [\$0]

RECOMMENDED MOTION: That the Board of Supervisors:

1. Receive and file Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment, Follow-up Audit

ACTION:Consent

Tanya Harris
Tanya Harris, Assistant Auditor Controller 3/11/2021

MINUTES OF THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS

**SUBMITTAL TO THE BOARD OF SUPERVISORS COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE,
STATE OF CALIFORNIA**

FINANCIAL DATA	Current Fiscal Year:	Next Fiscal Year:	Total Cost:	Ongoing Cost
COST	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.0
NET COUNTY COST	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.0	\$ 0.0
SOURCE OF FUNDS: N/A			Budget Adjustment: No	
			For Fiscal Year: n/a	

C.E.O. RECOMMENDATION: Approve

BACKGROUND:

Summary

We completed the follow-up audit of the Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder. Our audit was limited to reviewing actions taken as of December 3, 2020, to correct findings noted in our original audit report 2017-005 dated September 13, 2017. The original audit report contained two recommendations, all of which required implementation to help correct the reported findings.

Please refer to the audit report for the conclusion on the results of our audit.

For an in-depth understanding of the original audit, please refer to Internal Audit Report 2017-005 at www.auditorcontroller.org/Divisions/AuditsandSpecializedAccounting/InternalAuditReports.

Impact on Residents and Businesses

Provide an assessment of internal controls over the audited areas.

SUPPLEMENTAL:

Additional Fiscal Information

Not applicable

ATTACHMENT A.

Riverside County Auditor-Controller - Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment, Follow-up Audit



Stephanie Perez, Principal Management Analyst 3/15/2021

Internal Audit Report 2021-302

**Riverside County
Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder
Control Environment
Follow-up Audit**

Report Date: March 9, 2021



**Office of Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
Riverside County Auditor-Controller
4080 Lemon Street, 11th Floor
Riverside, CA 92509
(951) 955-3800**

www.auditorcontroller.org



**COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE
OFFICE OF THE
AUDITOR-CONTROLLER**

County Administrative Center
4080 Lemon Street, 11th Floor
P.O. Box 1326
Riverside, CA 92502-1326
(951) 955-3800
Fax (951) 955-3802

ACC | **AUDITOR
CONTROLLER**
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE

**Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
Riverside County Auditor-Controller**

**Tanya S. Harris, DPA, CPA
Assistant Auditor-Controller**

March 9, 2021

Peter Aldana
Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder
Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder
480 Lemon Street, 5th and 6th floor
Riverside, CA 92501

Subject: Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment, Follow-up Audit

Dear Mr. Aldana:

We completed the follow-up audit of Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment. Our audit was limited to reviewing actions taken as of December 3, 2020, to help correct the findings noted in our original audit report 2017-005 dated September 13, 2017.

We conducted our audit in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing. These standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain reasonable assurance that our objective, as described in the preceding paragraph, is achieved. Additionally, the standards require that we conduct the audit to provide sufficient, reliable, and relevant evidence to achieve the audit objectives. We believe the audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusion.

The original audit report contained two recommendations, all of which required implementation to help correct the reported findings. Based on the results of our audit, we found that of the two recommendations:

- One of the recommendations was implemented.
- One of the recommendations was partially implemented.

**Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder,
Control Environment, Follow-up Audit**

Details of the findings from the original audit and the status of the implementation of the recommendations are provided in this report. For an in-depth understanding of the original audit and your response to the audit report, please refer to the attached Internal Audit Report 2017-005. You can also find the audit report on the Auditor-Controller's website located at www.auditorcontroller.org/Divisions/AuditsandSpecializedAccounting/InternalAuditReports.

Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
Riverside County Auditor-Controller



By: René Casillas, CPA, CRMA
Chief Internal Auditor

cc: Board of Supervisors
Jeffrey A. Van Wagenen, County Executive Officer
Grand Jury

**Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder,
Control Environment, Follow-up Audit**

Table of Contents

	Page
Results:	
Performance Evaluations.....	4
Formal Succession Plan	5

Attachments:

- A. Internal Audit Report 2017-005
- B. Status of Findings as Reported by : Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder on December 3, 2020

**Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder,
Control Environment, Follow-up Audit**

Performance Evaluations

Finding 1: Performance Evaluations

Riverside County Board of Supervisors Policy, C-21, *Employee Performance Evaluation Reports*, Section 3 (b) states, "...regular employees of Riverside County shall be evaluated on an annual basis, approximately on the anniversary of their initial employment with count or on the anniversary of promotion or entry into their current job classification." Annual performance evaluations were not completed for 29 of the 34 employees we reviewed in our sample. The lack of performance evaluations has been attributed to their preferred focus on daily operations due to workloads and management's mentoring, coaching, and developing of staff throughout the year. Delayed performance evaluations can defer the achievement of the department's overall mission and goals which ordinarily allows the employees performance to be enhanced within the organization as it reveals the need for improvement in areas which affect the achievement of the departments set goals.

The Department is in the process of developing 360 performance evaluations which will establish goals specific area to each section.

Recommendation 1

Complete all performance evaluations when required.

Current Status 1: Partially Implemented

Based on our limited review of the system utilized to manage the departments performance evaluations, this recommendation is partially implemented. The department is currently using CornerStone system for managing its performance evaluations. However, there are plans to implement the system utilized by Riverside County Human Resources, as CornerStone has not performed as expected. We found that six of 30 performance evaluations sampled were not completed timely.

**Internal Audit Report 2021-302: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder,
Control Environment, Follow-up Audit**

Formal Succession Plan

Finding 2: Formal Succession Plan

The Assessor does not have a formal written succession plan. However, the department does have a verbal plan for executive managers and key employees. Formal plans would identify risks and strategies, providing a basis for specific succession initiatives, including how employees are eligible to participate. In addition, transfer of knowledge is a critical component of succession management. Written procedures formalize the experience-transfer from management and key personnel to successors. Without a succession plan, an organization may not have the means of ensuring that services important to its operations are maintained when management or key personnel changes occur.

Recommendation 2

Develop formal written succession plan for management and key personnel.

Current Status 2: Implemented

Attachment A

Internal Audit Report 2017-005

**Riverside County
Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder**

Report Date: September 13, 2017



**Office of Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
Riverside County Auditor-Controller
4080 Lemon Street, 11th Floor
Riverside, CA 92509
(951) 955-3800**

www.auditorcontroller.org



**COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE
OFFICE OF THE
AUDITOR-CONTROLLER**

County Administrative Center
4080 Lemon Street, 11th Floor
P.O. Box 1326
Riverside, CA 92502-1326
(951) 955-3800
Fax (951) 955-3802



Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
Riverside County Auditor-Controller

Frankie Ezzat, MPA
Assistant Auditor-Controller

September 13, 2017

Peter Aldana
Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder
Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder
2724 Gateway Drive
Riverside, CA 92507

Subject: Internal Audit Report 2017-005: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment

Dear Mr. Aldana:

We have completed an audit of Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder to provide management and the Board of Supervisors with an independent assessment of internal controls over the adequacy and effectiveness of the control environment. We conducted the audit from December 20, 2016, through May 15, 2017, for operations from July 1, 2014, through March 31, 2017.

We conducted our audit in accordance with the International Standards for the Professional Practice of Internal Auditing. These standards require that we plan and perform the audit to obtain sufficient, reliable, relevant and useful information to provide reasonable assurance that our objective as described above is achieved. An internal audit includes the systematic analysis of information to evaluate and improve the effectiveness of internal controls. We believe this audit provides a reasonable basis for our conclusion.

Internal controls are processes designed to provide management reasonable assurance of achieving efficiency of operations, compliance with laws and regulations, and reliability of financial and non-financial information. Management is responsible for establishing and maintaining adequate internal controls. Our responsibility is to evaluate the internal controls.

Based upon the results of our audit, we identified areas of opportunities that can help department management optimize the internal control component known as the control environment. Specifically, in the areas related to performance evaluations, succession planning, and completion of public service ethics training.

As requested, in accordance with paragraph III.C of the Board of Supervisors Resolution 83-338, management responded to each reported condition and recommendation contained in our report. Management's responses are included in the report. We will follow-up to verify that management implemented the corrective actions.

Internal Audit Report 2017-005: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment

We thank the Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder management and staff for their cooperation. Their assistance contributed significantly to the successful completion of this audit.

Paul Angulo, CPA, MA
Riverside County Auditor-Controller



By: René Casillas, CPA, CRMA
Interim Chief Internal Auditor

cc: Board of Supervisors
Executive Office
Grand Jury

Table of Contents

	Page
Executive Summary	4
Results:	
Control Environment	5

Executive Summary

Overview

The mission for Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder (Department) is “to fulfill the legally and locally mandated function of the Assessor, County Clerk, Recorder and Records Management Program in an accurate, timely, professional and courteous manner and to ensure high quality service.”

“The Assessor mandate is to locate, inventory and value all taxable and exempt secured and unsecured property in Riverside County in accordance with the applicable constitutional, legislative and administrative provisions. The County Clerk mandate is to facilitate application and license for marriage and to perform marriage ceremonies, to file notary public oaths of office, fictitious business names and other items as mandated by law or ordinance. The Recorder is to record as mandated by law all recordable documents in connection with ownership and titling of properties and other negotiated items within the County of Riverside. To provide the recording, storage, and certification of all documents of births, deaths, and marriages occurring within the County of Riverside and other public records and to maintain in permanence all records pertaining to same. For the Records Management & Archives Program, it is to serve as the county's records manager by providing excellent in-house, contracted and advisory records management services in a cost-effective manner.” *Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Mission Statement, Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder website, accessed June 5, 2017, <http://www.asrclrec.com/About/MissionStatement.aspx>.*

Audit Objective

Our objective is to provide management and the Board of Supervisors with an independent assessment of the adequacy and effectiveness of the internal control component known as the control environment.

Audit Conclusion

Based upon the results of our audit, we identified areas of opportunities that can help Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder management optimize the internal control component known as the control environment. Specifically in the areas related to timely performance evaluations, succession planning, and completion of public service ethics training.

Control Environment

Background

Internal controls are a coordination of policies and procedures established to provide reasonable assurance regarding the achievement of respective organization objectives related to the effectiveness and efficiency of operations, compliance with applicable laws and regulations, reliability of reporting, and the safeguarding of assets. Everyone in an organization affects internal controls, but it is the ultimate responsibility of management to implement them and to ensure the controls are functioning as intended. Doing so allows management to stay focused on its pursuit of an organization's strategic objectives.

In support of management efforts to achieve the objectives of the organization, management should consider the following five internal control components:

- Control Environment: Sets the tone to the organization and is the foundation of all other internal control components
- Risk Assessments: Identifies and analyzes the risk associated with the achievement of the entity's objectives
- Control Activities: Actions established by policies and procedures to help ensure that management's directives are carried out
- Information and Communication: Actions to carry out the responsibilities in support of the achievement of the objectives
- Monitoring Activities: Ongoing or separate evaluations to ascertain whether each of the components of internal controls is present and functioning

For an organization to have an effective control environment, management should consistently demonstrate and communicate its commitment to integrity and ethical values, establish adequate governance oversight processes, and implement an organizational structure with adequate authority and responsibility. Furthermore, an organization should also demonstrate a commitment to attract, develop and retain a competent workforce, and have strong workforce accountability measures for the achievement of the organizational objectives.

Our audit focused on the control environment component since it is the foundation of an effective system of internal controls. It provides discipline and structure to the achievement of the primary objectives of an entity and establishes the tone from the top-down of organizations. As such, when management, at every level of the organization views internal controls as essential to the successful achievement of its objectives, it is expected that the same view will be conveyed to everyone within the organization and as a result, internal controls will work as designed. The opposite effect will occur when management view the internal controls as obstacles and/or unrelated to the achievement of the entity's objectives.

Internal Audit Report 2017-005: Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder, Control Environment

The scope included the following areas:

- Code of ethics – implementation, training and communication
- Employee developmental training
- Evaluations – completion and goal setting
- Organizational and reporting structure – effective and efficient
- Succession planning – development for business continuity
- Communication of mission and other pertinent matters
- Employee exit interviews – organizational improvement opportunities as viewed from department employees
- Policies and Procedures – development, implementation and communication

Objective

Our audit objective is to provide management and the Board of Supervisors with an independent assessment of the adequacy and effectiveness of Riverside County Assessor-County Clerk-Recorder control environment.

Audit Methodology

To accomplish our objectives, we:

- Identified and reviewed applicable codes, operations manuals, regulations, and policies
- Conducted interviews with Department management
- Selected a sample of employees and reviewed files for completion of employee evaluations, development training programs and goal setting
- Assessed the communication of ethical values and code of conduct for selected Department staff via a survey
- Performed an employee turnover analysis to determine the turnover rate and benchmarked against other local governments
- Reviewed organizational and reporting structure
- Determined if exit interviews were conducted

Finding 1: Performance Evaluations

Riverside County Board of Supervisors Policy, C-21, *Employee Performance Evaluation Reports*, Section 3 (b) states, "...regular employees of Riverside County shall be evaluated on an annual basis, approximately on the anniversary of their initial employment with count or on the anniversary of promotion or entry into their current job classification." Annual performance evaluations were not completed for 29 of the 34 employees we reviewed in our sample. The lack of performance evaluations has been attributed to their preferred focus on daily operations due to workloads and management's mentoring, coaching, and developing of staff throughout the year. Delayed performance evaluations can defer the achievement of the department's overall mission and goals which ordinarily allows the employees performance to be enhanced within the organization as it reveals the need for improvement in areas which affect the achievement of the departments set goals.

The Department is in the process of developing 360 performance evaluations which will establish goals specific area to each section.

Recommendation 1:

Complete all performance evaluations when required.

Management's Response:

Concur. "The ACR concurs that timely and effective employee evaluations are integral to staff development and the ACR is currently in the training phase of implementing a new evaluation process. Revamping the ACR's evaluation process started July 2016, when ACR began selecting a software package to structure and manage employee evaluations. The end goal is to make the evaluation process timely and more effective. The software also includes 360 degree feedback for supervisors and managers. Automated e-mail notifications, electronic routing and approval, in conjunction with continuous monitoring throughout the year will improve the timeliness of annual reviews. The ability for employees and their supervisors to progressively set goals and monitor progress will encourage two way communicate and engage employees. Supervisors and managers will be able to assess their effectiveness by the addition of a 360 degree component providing feedback from subordinates, peers, and managers. The ACR believes this will improve the employee evaluation process on many levels.

The ACR has worked diligently to complete the identified employee evaluations. Currently only 32% of the sample evaluations remain to be completed and we are confident that the new evaluation system will help to keep all employee evaluations current."

-Actual/estimated Date of Corrective Action: July 31, 2017

"Employee training will start on July 15, 2017, and it should be fully utilized by employees by July 31, 2017."

Finding 2: Formal Succession Plan

The Assessor does not have a formal written succession plan. However, the department does have a verbal plan for executive managers and key employees. Formal plans would identify risks and strategies, providing a basis for specific succession initiatives, including how employees are eligible to participate. In addition, transfer of knowledge is a critical component of succession management. Written procedures formalize the experience-transfer from management and key personnel to successors. Without a succession plan, an organization may not have the means of ensuring that services important to its operations are maintained when management or key personnel changes occur.

Recommendation 2:

Develop formal written succession plan for management and key personnel.

Management's Response:

Concur. "The ACR concurs that a formal succession plan should be developed. Currently the ACR is developing a succession plan as a component of its overall strategic plan. A formal succession plan will be completed by September 30, 2017, and will be shared with the appropriate staff as a roadmap leading into the future."

-Actual/estimated Date of Corrective Action: September 30, 2017

Finding 3: Public Service Ethics Training

Riverside County Board Policy A-60, *Ethics Training for Local Officials*, states "individuals shall receive at least two hours of training in general ethics principles and ethics laws relevant to his or her public service every two years..." which includes Board of Supervisors, all elected county officials, any member of the legislative body and any employee designated by the Board of Supervisors. Public service ethics training required was not completed by a member of the Assessor. Upon notification of incompleteness, the department member completed the training on February 23, 2017, and provided the certificate.

Recommendation 3:

We found a single instance that board policy was not followed. It was corrected when we brought it to their attention. As such, we make no recommendation.



PETER ALDANA
COUNTY OF RIVERSIDE
ASSESSOR-COUNTY CLERK-RECORDER

Assessor
(951) 955-6200

County Clerk-Recorder
(951) 486-7000

Mailing Address
P.O. Box 751
Riverside, CA 92502-0751

www.riversideacr.com
www.riversidetaxinfo.com

Attachment B

December 3, 2020

To: Rene Casillas, Chief Internal Auditor

Referenced below is our “current status” with regards to Audit Findings 1 and 2 of the ACR’s Control Environment Internal Audit 2017-05. Please let me know if you have any questions or need additional information.

Finding #1 Response:

The ACR has implemented a new performance evaluation program, Cornerstone. This program was in the training phase at the time of the 2017 audit. This new program has enabled the ACR to increase the timeliness of employee reviews. The last report to the Riverside County Board of Supervisors 10/20/20 showed a completion rate of 84%. The evals incomplete were due to various reasons including PIP, FMLA, MLOA, LOA, etc. As of 11/20/20, the evals are at 98% complete.

Finding #2 Response:

The ACR has implemented a number of formal processes to help identify and ready talent for purposes of succession, as emphasized within our Strategic Plan (Strategic Objective 1). One of the tools born out of this initiative was the development of KPI reports that communicate how well we are doing with regards to establishing professional developmental plans; the report also helps us plan for turn-over by estimating upcoming attrition based on key demographics and historical patterns. We have also leveraged our customized performance review process to assist us in identifying high potential employees and arrive at their development path. Our office recently established a formal mentorship curriculum, facilitated by Executive leadership, designed to help staff further develop their leadership competencies. These are just a few complimentary efforts that make up our succession plan, aimed at ensuring that we have talented staff members ready to take on leadership and other key roles as they become available.

Respectfully,

Douglas Cady for Peter Aldana